

Terms of Reference for the Independent Evaluation of

“Gajimu.com/garment”

C&A Foundation seeks an Evaluation Team for undertaking an external evaluation of the initiative “Gajimu.com/garment”, initiative implemented by WageIndicator Indonesia and funded by C&A Foundation.

Complete proposals must be submitted to by 12 December 2018.

I. Introduction

C&A Foundation is the corporate foundation of the fashion and apparel retailer C&A. The foundation was founded in 2011 and reorganised to focus on the fashion industry in late 2013. The goal of the foundation is to transform the fashion industry, placing it on a socially and environmentally sustainable trajectory. The foundation works with partners in the global north and south, giving them financial support, expertise and networks. The foundation collaborates with a variety of stakeholders, including NGOs and industry partners, and through them works with innovators, smallholder farmers and garment workers.

In conducting its work and providing grants, the foundation places a strong emphasis on women and girls, as they are disproportionately affected by the issues (e.g., poor working conditions and forced and child labour) affecting the industry. Over the course of first strategic programming period the foundation has concentrated efforts in five programmes: accelerating sustainable cotton, improving working conditions, eliminating forced and child labour, fostering a transition to circular fashion, and strengthening communities.

This initiative is funded as part of C&A Foundation’s working conditions programme. The Working Conditions programme focuses on increasing accountability for working conditions in the following ways:

1. Public disclosure of supply chains, working conditions and purchasing practices in a manner which incentivises improvements;
2. Supporting workers to negotiate for the issues they prioritise, including supporting workers to use publicly disclosed data in their negotiations;
3. Advocacy for adoption and enforcement of policies which support public disclosure and uphold workers’ rights to freedom of association and collective bargaining.

C&A Foundation

C&A Foundation is commissioning this evaluation to arrive at an objective assessment of successes, failures and missed opportunities as well as a focused set of recommendations and lessons to inform WageIndicator Indonesia and C&A Foundation's future work.

The terms of reference present a brief description of the initiative; scope; objectives and key questions; evaluation methodology; stakeholder involvement; roles and responsibilities; evaluation process; deliverables; audience and dissemination; consultant qualifications and projected level of effort.

The evaluation is required to be submitted to C&A Foundation by 15 March 2019.

II. The Initiative

The initiative "Gajimu.com/garment" started in April 2017 and is set to continue until March 2019.

Compliance with minimum wages, overtime payment and labour laws in general is a major problem in the garment industry in Indonesia. This is well documented in several reports, including those published by WageIndicator, and Better Work Indonesia.

Considering this, WageIndicator developed a proposal to reduce non-compliance in apparel factories by leveraging both the rise of mobile internet in Indonesia and WageIndicator's 16 years of experience collecting data on wages and working conditions online. Specifically, WageIndicator proposed to do this by:

- Letting workers check compliance on minimum wages and labour law (online and face-to-face), and reporting the results to trade unions and to employers, offering support and information to achieve compliance;
- Collecting CBA's, assess clauses and offer model clauses to improve working conditions to comply with minimum wages and labour law, and further improve beyond legal minimum;
- Publishing factory pages online, summarizing results from compliance checks and current CBAs per factory, enabling more effective monitoring of working conditions by workers, employers, brands, and buyers.

Wage Indicator planned eight activities to achieve this:

1. Development. Adapt Wage Indicator's existing minimum wage and labour law surveys to incorporate compliance checks specifically for the apparel industry and offer the surveys online and in a newly developed app that could also be used offline in face-to-face interviews.

C&A Foundation

2. Outreach. Offer garment workers the opportunity to check compliance of their factory conditions against the law, through conducting face to face surveys with partners KSBSI and Garteks, and online. Workers would instantly receive feedback on whether their wages and conditions complied with the law, and the data would be archived by factory with worker identity kept anonymous.
3. Reporting and Discussing. Report survey results by factory to trade unions and factory management, including quarterly alerts on cases of non-compliance to promote discussions on strategies to improve compliance on individual worker level and by means of collective bargaining resulting in new and enhanced collective bargaining agreements.
4. Collective agreements. Collect, assess and score existing Indonesian garment industry CBAs, publishing them in the Wage Indicator Collective Agreement Database to show the relative levels of various working conditions using the WageIndicator assessment framework.
5. Factory pages. Develop new factory pages for the Gajimu website, uploading summarized information collected from workers and CBAs per factory, updating pages quarterly.
6. Engage brands. Promote the use of factory pages by brands to monitor working conditions within factories in their supply chains and require measurable improvements.
7. Multilingual Gajimu websites. Develop both English and Bahasa versions for the factory pages.
8. UX reviews. Carry out continuous improvement of gajimu.com/garment user experience, with advice of external UX expert.

III. Scope

The independent evaluation should be a summative evaluation that assesses the extent to which the initiative achieved the intended objectives. The evaluation must also arrive at significant learning on the extent to which the initiative's design and implementation contributed to intended outcomes.

IV. Objectives and Questions

The Evaluation Objectives are to:

- Examine the initiative's overall effectiveness, sustainability and impact in improving working conditions in Indonesia;

C&A Foundation

- Assess factors (in design and operations) that have contribute to or impeded achievement of results, allowing to learn from success as well as failures;
- Assess the extent to which the initiative is 'fit for purpose';
- Distil actionable and strategic recommendations and lessons from the findings to feed into future C&A Foundation and WageIndicator Indonesia operations.

Evaluation Questions:

The specific evaluation questions will include, but are not limited to the following:

Relevance, Design and Fit:

- To what extent are the initiative strategies and objectives aligned to the promotion of better working conditions?
- To what extent are the initiative strategies and objectives aligned with C&A Foundation and WageIndicator Indonesia's vision and mission?
- How well does it address underlying needs and their root causes and leverage strengths and opportunities?
- What specific, existing gaps were filled by the initiative in promoting better working conditions in Indonesia?
- To what extent WageIndicator Indonesia and its partners had the relevant skills and experience to deliver the activities proposed?
- To what extent was the initiative design (including strategy and time for implementation) appropriate in achieving the intended objectives?

Efficiency:

- To what extent have the initiative been executed in an efficient manner?
- To what extent has the initiative been cost-effective?
- To what extent did the initiative align with WageIndicator and their partners' strengths?
- Did the initiative track outputs and outcomes in a credible, systematic manner? If yes, how?
- What mechanisms (formal or informal) had been put into practice to capture and use results, experiences and lessons (allowing for adaptive management)?

Effectiveness and Results:

C&A Foundation

- What were the results of the initiative? Did it meet the outcome targets as per the log-frame?
 - What external and internal factors as well as challenges and risks have influenced the initiative delivery, results, successes and failures? And why?
- How equitable and worthwhile are the outcomes of the initiative so far and/or how strong is the progress?
- Did the initiative sufficiently involve/engage with relevant actors and stakeholders? If so, how?
- What are the drivers (both positive and negative) that influence transparency in the apparel supply chain in Indonesia?
- How well is this initiative delivering what's most needed, to the right people and places, at the right times, in the right ways?
 - What should the initiative do to scale and sustain these in the future?
- How effectively is this particular initiative contributing to wider system shifts and long-term industry transformation?
- To what extent does the initiative help amplify the effects of other initiatives? What amplifies or limits its effectiveness and impact?

Sustainability:

- What are the main factors that promoted and/or reduced the sustainability and results of the initiative?
- To what extent is the initiative likely to continue after the C&A Foundation funding ends?
- What were the missed opportunities?

Methodology

Design: The evaluation design will be primarily based on the review of the existing documents, monitoring data, and reconstruction of the programme theory with appropriate indicators. The programme theory will be empirically tested through collection and review of quantitative data and conducting qualitative fieldwork. This will establish a logical model of cause-effect linkages by exploring the delivery of results, e.g., using contribution analysis. Reconstructing the programme theory will be a critical first part of the evaluation prior to conducting review of data and fieldwork and will be done through a combination of documentary review and interviews with C&A Foundation's Effective Philanthropy Team, Working Conditions Programme Team, and WageIndicator Indonesia.

C&A Foundation

Methodology: The evaluation will be required to employ a mixed-methodological approach to ensure that data can be sufficiently triangulated to deliver aggregate quantitative and qualitative judgments; initiative documents; existing monitoring data; interviews and/or focus groups, etc.

In addition to this, the evaluation team will employ a rating system (Good, Adequate, Poor) that rates the initiative’s overall performance. The rating will be developed in consultation with the Effective Philanthropy team at the foundation.

The data analysis will be used to provide critical insight into the implementation and results of the initiative internally and externally and why as well as how the initiative has produced results or not. The qualitative data will be complemented with quantitative data from the monitoring data and/or survey of implementers and key actors. The evaluation will follow, but is not restricted to, the mentioned data collection methods. Attention needs to be paid to triangulating feedback different actors in order to ensure validity.

Review of Monitoring Data, Reports, and Relevant Documents	All monitoring data held by WageIndicator Indonesia and C&A Foundation and other relevant documents
Semi-structured Interviews and/or Focus Group Discussions (FGDs)	Conducted with workers, unions, brands, and factories representatives; partners and/or key local stakeholders. In addition, relevant WageIndicator Indonesia and C&A Foundation staff will be interviewed
Sampling	Purposive sampling will be done for identification of the workers, unions, brands, and factories representatives and key stakeholders for surveys, interview and focus groups.

V. Stakeholder Involvement

Stakeholder involvement is critical to the successful execution of the evaluation. The evaluation consultancy is expected to retain independence in coming to judgments about the initiative but employ participatory and collaborative approach providing for meaningful involvement of the following key stakeholders:

- Relevant WageIndicator Indonesia staff, both part of management and those involved in initiative delivery
- Key staff at C&A foundation involved with this initiative

C&A Foundation

- Workers¹
- Unions, Factories, and Brands representatives

The draft report will be circulated to relevant WageIndicator Indonesia and C&A Foundation staff and management for review and comments and discussed in a meeting prior to finalisation.

VI. Roles and Responsibilities

The Evaluation Manager² (João Martinho) at C&A Foundation is responsible for:

- Overall responsibility and accountability for management and delivery of the evaluation up to and including approval of the final report;
- Technical guidance for the evaluation consultants throughout the implementation of the evaluation up to and including participation / observation of field visits;
- Leadership of the evaluation draft report review process including collating comments and facilitating discussion and management responses
- Preparation of lessons note, for external publication.

The Programme Manager at C&A Foundation is responsible for:

- Facilitation of access to initiative related data, all documents, and access to stakeholders (internal and external);
- Reviewing and commenting on drafts of the inception and evaluation report;
- Preparing a programme management response, as and when necessary.

The Programme Manager at WageIndicator Indonesia is responsible for:

- Facilitating access to initiative data, documents, and stakeholders;
- Reviewing and commenting on drafts of the inception and evaluation report;
- Preparing a partner management response, as and when necessary.

The evaluation consultants are responsible for:

- Conducting all necessary qualitative and quantitative assessments and fieldwork;

¹ The proposal should state how the evaluation team will manage worker interviews to be sensitive to workers needs (i.e., scheduling interviews/focus groups/surveys with workers; compensating to workers for their participation; etc.)

² The Evaluation Manager is not involved in the management of the initiative or the day to day operation

C&A Foundation

- Logistics for their own field work, including travel, scheduling and hosting of focus groups and interviews, compensation for interviewees;
- Day-to-day management of the evaluation;
- Regular formal and informal reporting to the Evaluation Manager;
- Participation in key evaluation related meetings (kick off meeting, inception report meeting and draft findings meeting etc.);
- Production of deliverables (inception report and evaluation report) in accordance with the Terms of Reference and contractual arrangements.

The evaluation consultants will report to João Martinho – Evaluation Specialist, C&A Foundation on all issues related to the evaluation, contracts, fees, and deliverables and commenting / responses processes.

VII. Evaluation Process

The evaluation will be carried out in conformity with the principles and standards set out in C&A Foundation minimum requirements and policy for Monitoring and Evaluation.

The consultants will prepare an evaluation inception report and work-plan that will operationalise the Terms of Reference. The inception report will be based on initial documentary review and preliminary interviews with different actors including workers.

The inception report and work-plan will address the following elements: expectations of the evaluation; roles and responsibilities within the evaluation consulting team; elaboration of the initiative programme theory, as appropriate; any refinements and elaboration to evaluation questions; methods – qualitative and quantitative and data collection, including possible constraints; outline of the final evaluation report and an evaluation matrix linking questions – methods – data sources and indicators.

The inception report and work-plan will be approved by the Evaluation Specialist and act as an agreement between the consultants and the C&A Foundation on how the evaluation is to be conducted.

The consultants will prepare the draft and final evaluation reports that describe the evaluation methodology, findings, recommendations and key lessons.

If significant differences arise regarding the interpretation of evidence between C&A Foundation and/or WageIndicator Indonesia programme management on the external evaluation report, an opportunity will be provided to formulate management responses to the findings and recommendations. This will be published with the final report.

The main activities and evaluation timetable for this consultancy is set out below:

Evaluation Process	Deadline	Responsibility / Participants
Proposal	12 December 2018	Consultant Team
Selection of consultancy	21 December 2018	Evaluation Specialist
Kick off meeting (Jakarta, Indonesia)	11 January 2019	Evaluation Specialist, Programme Managers at WageIndicator Indonesia and C&A Foundation, Consultant Team
Inception report	25 January 2019	Consultant Team
Preliminary report	22 February 2019	Consultant Team / Evaluation Specialist (facilitator)
Findings meeting (Jakarta, Indonesia)	1 March 2019	Evaluation Specialist, Programme Managers at WageIndicator Indonesia and C&A Foundation, Consultant Team
Final report	8 March 2019	Consultant Team

VIII. Deliverables

The evaluation requires the consultant to submit the following deliverables:

- Inception report
- Draft evaluation report
- Findings meeting
- Final evaluation report, not to exceed 25 pages, with a two-page executive summary

IX. Audience and Dissemination

Main audiences for the evaluation will be: C&A Foundation and WageIndicator Indonesia. The final evaluation report will be published and disseminated through the C&A Foundation and WageIndicator Indonesia websites and social media channels, as appropriate and necessary.

Learning products including a lessons note will be developed after the completion of the evaluation.

X. Consultant Requirements

Applicants may be individual consultant, a group of individual consultants with a designated team lead, or consulting companies with relevant evaluation expertise. Applicants must have at a minimum the following qualifications:

- Experience in conducting evaluations to a high standard in the region;
- Demonstrated experience in conducting evaluations related to improving factory working conditions through worker and/or union negotiations, ideally in the apparel industry;
- Knowledge of supply chain monitoring and transparency; understanding of the current thinking and attitudes around working conditions today;
- Demonstrated familiarity with online data collection and disclosure including evaluating relevant online user engagement metrics;
- Strong facilitation skills and proven ability to lead participatory processes;
- No conflict of interest with C&A Foundation, C&A company or WageIndicator Indonesia;
- At least one member of the evaluation team must be a gender specialist;
- At least one member of the evaluation team must have working knowledge of Bahasa.

Please submit the following to João Martinho (j.martinho@candafoundation.org) by 12 December 2018:

A. Technical Proposal

A narrative proposal (no more than 5 - 6 pages excluding annexes) and including the following sections:

- Evaluation Methodology: Describe your overall approach and evaluation methodology including, and not limited to, evaluation questions, evaluation design and methodology.
- Relevant Experience: Provide details of projects of similar scope, complexity and nature you have worked on previously.
- Specific Expertise: Describe your level of knowledge and expertise in working conditions, gender and empowerment, supply chains and transparency.

C&A Foundation

- Key Personnel and Staffing: Describe the key personnel. Include CVs (no more than 2 pages each and attached as annex) of key personnel who would be part of the proposed plan.
- Timeline: Include a detailed timeline of key activities.

B. Financial proposal

The financial proposal should include a line-item budget and a budget narrative. The cost estimates used to prepare the budget should be presented in Euros.